

Minutes

Meeting of Qualification Commission

Tallinn, First Session, 1st October 2013

Attendance:

Chairman and Secretary: Ignatius Leong (SIN), Nick Faulks (BER)

Honorary Adviser: Andrzej Filipowicz (POL)

Councillors: Werner Stubenvoll (AUT), Michalis Kaloumenos (GRE), Dr. Dirk J.A De Ridder (BEL)

Members: Walter Brown (USA), Christian Krause (GER), Vladimir Kukaev (RUS)

Observers: Sevan A Muradian (USA), Ashot Vardapetyan (ARM), Mahdi Abdulrahim (UAE), Franca Dapiran (ITA), Shaun Press (PNG), Jouni Lehtivaara (FIN), Igor Vereshchagin (RUS), Jeff Sonas (USA), Francisco Guadalupe (USA), Samir Zerdali (ALG), Ali Nihat Yazici (TUR), Gary Wastell (AUS), Roberto Ricca (ITA), Hal Bond (CAN), Stephen Kisuze (UGA), Robert Katende (UGA), Yuriy Gnyp (UKR), Mehrdad Pahlevanzadeh (IRI), Panagiotis Nikolopoulos (GRE), Herman Hamers (NED), Arthur Schuering (NED), Ralph Alt (GER), Klaus Deventer (GER), Lakhdar Mazouz (ALG), Nigel Freeman (BER), Inaganti Amarnath (IND), Thomas Luther (GER), Allan Herbert (BAR), Hadi Karimi (IRI), Russell Smith (TTO), Igor Glek (GER), Varlam Vepkhvishvili (GEO)

1. Event registration. NF reported that, following a crackdown on late registration of FIDE rated events, this is no longer a major systemic problem. An exception is FIDE's own events, which are routinely registered late or by host federations, and IL confirmed that from now on this must be done by Elista. MK reminded the meeting that events offering norms must be registered 30 days before the start, which at present needs to be checked manually. Rules for registering and reporting long team events must be prepared in detail.
2. Rating manipulation. NF reported that we have received complaints relating to alleged rating manipulation of two different types. Some players may have artificially lowered their ratings in order to qualify for large class prizes. It was felt that the organisers themselves could deal with this, and WB explained how this is done in the US, where such events have been in the calendar for many years. Others may have inflated their ratings, perhaps to obtain FIDE titles. Elista will produce a list of "suspicious" rating moves for further investigate.
3. Events reported late or not at all. NF has started an analysis of this problem, which may be serious. There is at present no penalty, since events never reported are for administrative reasons are not charged. They may be deleted free of charge, or are eventually simply removed from the list. This must change, and we must investigate cases where events which do take place are for some reason never reported for rating.
4. Title Reg 1.43a. A proposal from GEO to extend the scope of this concession was considered and rejected (2 votes in favour).
5. Deadlines for title applications – already dealt with.
6. IBCA titles. We shall discuss with GM Luther when he arrives
7. Bonus games in norms from old Olympiads. BEL will be asked to submit a formal title application so that this specific case can be considered.
8. Performance norms from World Team events. One particular case in under discussion, but we shall check for any others before making a recommendation.

9. The CA of a norm event was not an IA or FA, but his deputy was. This has been considered cause for rejection, but we need to define more carefully the definition of “conducting” an event.
10. The proposal from Austria, supported by England, relating to assistant arbiters in FIDE rated events, was rejected.
11. Proposal from Georgian federation. Already covered in (4).
12. The current title applications do not provide the Titles group with all the data they need. This will be addressed in conjunction with new event registration forms.
13. There is a problem with a few players who have obtained FM titles on the basis of initial ratings from a small number of games. A rule change will be proposed, under which all future FM, WFM, CM and WCM titles will be given only to players with at least 27 rated games.
13. (misnumbered, with apology) A Chessbase article appeared a few months ago which presented FIDE titles in a poor light. There was no general agreement within the QC on whether a response should be sent, and in the end none was sent. We need a policy so that we are at least in a position to act promptly in future.
- 14 – 16. Deferred to second session.
17. VK said that Elista currently check Licensed Arbiters manually, but will develop an automated system.
18. The framework of a functioning QC website will be agreed before we leave Tallinn.
19. MK reported that there is a plan to incorporate CIS ratings into a wider system.
20. MK and Ali Yacizi described plans for FIDE involvement in internet chess competition. A committee will be formed, including IL and MK from the QC, to develop this further.
21. MK reported on preliminary work by the ACC. There will be a meeting of that commission later in the week.

QC meeting, middle session, Tallinn 2013

Attendance:

Chairman: Ignatius Leong (SIN)

Councillors: Michalis Kaloumenos (GRE), Dr. Dirk J.A De Ridder (BEL)

Members: Walter Brown (USA), Christian Krause (GER), Casto Abundo (PHI), Vladimir Kukaev (RUS)

Observers: Georgios Makropoulos (GRE), Sevan A Muradian (USA), Klaus Deventer (GER) Fidel Gonzales (VEN), Beatriz Marinello (USA), Luxman Wijesuriya (SRI), Mehrdad Pahlevanzadeh (IRI), Ali Nihat Yazici (TUR), Kevin O'Connell (IRL), Taha Jassim (BRN), Tomasz Sielicki (POL), Russell Smith (TTO), Gaguik Oganessian (ARM), Uvencio Blanco (VEN), Francisco Guadalupe (USA), Roberto Ricca (ITA), Herman Hamers (NED), Shaun Press (PNG), Hal Bond (CAN), Ashot Vardapetyan (ARM), Stephen Boyd (FRA), Varlam Vepkhvishvili (GEO), Igor Vereshchagin (RUS), Shaker Al-Afoo (BRN), Hesham Elgendy (EGY), Adam Dzwonkowski (POL), Ameer Madhloom Dhafer Abdul (IRQ), Kurt Jungwirth (AUT), Tomasz Sielicki (POL)

MK introduced some contentious title applications. He stressed that this was the work of the Titles Group, not just his own.

1. An interim rating for a GM title was found to be flawed.
2. The GM norm for Irina Krush from the World Teams Championship was accepted. We shall amend the regulation to make clear that this event carries the same status as an Olympiad.

3. It was accepted that a “Schiller system” event from 2011 had been specifically approved for norms by a previous QC Chairman. This will be honoured, and norms accepted, but no future Scheveningen events of any sort will be accepted.
4. VK confirmed that federations are able to delete events previously registered for rating without question. From now on we shall keep careful track of these cases, and a fee structure will be introduced.
5. IL confirmed that he was agreeable to the agreement with USCF relating to their use of FIDE Laws in rated events taking effect from 1.7.14. This was accepted unanimously.
6. The calculation of rapid and blitz ratings for periods where a large number of games have been played was discussed. MK has considered the idea that $k=20$ should be replaced by $k=700/n$, where n is the number of games played and exceeds 35. He confirms that it appears to be suitable, and this idea will be proposed for implementation from the 1.11.13 list.
7. NF had previously confirmed that games such as “Armageddon”, where the players do not play under the same conditions, could not be rated. There was no disagreement with this.
8. There has been a request from the Greek federation for thematic tournaments to be rated. This was approved on a vote of 5-2, subject to the condition that it takes the form of pairs of games, with each player having White and Black.
9. There has been a complaint from a player that they have paid the fee for a title to their federation, which has not applied for it. This is not a QC problem, but we shall draw this case to the attention of their Continental President.
10. Kotainy case. IL said that he was minded to reverse the decision taken in Tromso, whereby the federation’s report was overruled for rating purposes. The motion that the federation’s report be accepted as received was approved by a vote of 8-1.
11. CK asked for confirmation that it is acceptable for a player to take part in two different events on the same day. There is no objection, provided that it never happens that two games are played at the same time. No 12 hours of play per day restriction need apply to the player.
12. Some norms have been received in respect of tournaments which were registered slightly less than 30 days in advance. Both of these came from federations which have good records in this respect, so we shall allow these norms, with reminders to the federations that this must not be allowed to happen again.
13. Jeff Sonas joined the meeting, and gave a brief preview the presentation he intended to make in the final session. This appeared to be ideal for its purpose. CK asked him to check the average rating movement from 2010 to 2012 of players who obtained initial ratings in 2010, and that will be done.

Minutes of QC meeting, final session, Tallinn

FIDE Deputy President Makropoulos made some brief comments regarding the Playing Zone project. He confirmed that the QC was not being asked to approve the CNC agreement, which has in any case already been approved by FIDE, but to confirm that they would assist in the development of the regulations for play and rating. He confirmed FIDE’s intention that internet rapid and blitz games will be merged with those played over the board as soon as possible, (with an extension to all games in due course). He asked that the QC ensure that the new regulations can be passed through all necessary bodies with greater than normal speed. After answering some questions, he left the meeting.

Jeff Sonas then gave a presentation relating to his work on the rating system since the Councillors’ meeting in Athens. He showed how the results of games between players of various ratings have differed from those predicted by the probability table, and then how a variety changes to the parameters in the rating system would have improved the predictive success.

The basic recommendations from Athens were confirmed as having considerable value. These are that the k factors should be altered from 10, 15, 30 to 10, 20, 40 respectively. These appear to be close to optimal. Superimposed on these changes, he had considered the effect of a proposal from Sean Hewitt, that the k factor applicable to players aged under 18 should remain at 40 until they reach a rating of 2300. This resulted in a further agreement in accuracy. The meeting agreed without opposition that these changes should be recommended to take place from 1.7.14.

Christian Krause had previously asked for the average change in rating over their first two years of all players who obtained initial ratings in 2010. The answer is that on average they gained 17 points.

FIDE Vice President Ali Yacizi outlined how the Playing Zone will be managed. Michalis Kaloumenos will oversee its administration, with considerable powers to take immediate decisions in the case of rule infractions. AY reiterated that it is vital that the Playing Zone should be put in place as quickly as possible.

The Chairman described the new plans for the registration and licensing of players (Annex 12 in the Congress Agenda). There will be a Provisional Player Flag, which must not be confused with the FIDE flag, which will be available to players who wish to play in a rated event but are unable to obtain an ID from the federation they regard as their home. This flag will not entitle them to play in any official FIDE event.

The proposal was approved by a majority vote of the meeting and of the Commission.

The Secretary introduced a proposed new Tournament Registration Form for consideration. This contains much new information, and has been designed specifically to serve the needs of the Titles Administrator as well as the Ratings Administrator. It is intended to be user- friendly for rating officers. Everyone is invited to put forward further ideas for data to be included.

The Titles Administrator read a list of rejected title applications. Only one of the rejections was opposed from the floor, in a case relating to Reg 1.43e. Some of the required foreign players had been found to be missing for some or most rounds. The rejection was confirmed by a vote. It was also agreed that the wording of 1.43e should be expanded to avoid future disagreements, and one suggestion was that every round must include games played by the requisite mix of foreign players. This was approved, and will be drafted.

AY spoke against the agreement which has been reached with the USCF whereby rated events in the US which do not offer norms may be played under USCF Laws until FIDE's new Laws come into effect on 1.7.14. He would prefer this to take place immediately. The Commission had in fact already confirmed its approval of the agreement at its supplementary meeting, but the matter will doubtless be raised at EB.

A proposal from Sevan Muradian to reduce the minimum duration of rated games from two hours per player to one hour was tabled. This was approved 16-9 by the meeting, and 4-3 by the Commission.

The meeting closed at 7.30pm.

Chairman

Secretary

Ignatius Leong

Nick Faulks