

July 16, 2012

To: Mr. Georgios Makropoulos,
FIDE Deputy President

Re: TRG Seminar in Caldas Novas, Brazil, November 2011.

Dear Georgios:

This correspondence is in response to your e-mail dated July 2, 2012 regarding the error in the final report, which had Mr. De Silva on the title award list.

At the conclusion of the seminar, those participants who attended the entire seminar were required to take and passed the written examination drafted by the TRG. Mr. Gurevich and I awarded titles to only those trainers who had participated in the seminar, who took and passed the examination, and had the proper credentials.

To provide the TRG with a report of the seminar and its results I used the list of pre-registered trainers as a starting point, removed the names of those people who did not come to the seminar or who had left the seminar and then added the names of those trainers who registered on-site. Erroneously, I did not delete one name from the initial participant/award list, that of Mr. Da Silva Jefferson Rian, who had pre-registered for the seminar, but who did not actually participate in the seminar. Shortly before my departure from Caldas Novas the report (see attached e-mail #1) was submitted internally to TRG Chairman Adrian Mikhalchishin, TRG Secretary Efstratios Grivas and my fellow lecturer Mikhail Gurevich for their review and approval.

Upon my arrival in the United States, I saw an e-mail from Mr. Darcy Lima stating that he was appealing Mr. Da Silva's title award as he was not in attendance at the seminar. Immediately, I checked my notes and recognized the clerical error. Upon confirming that his name was erroneously listed, I sent a second internal e-mail (see attached e-mail #2) clarifying the mistake and requesting that Mr. Da Silva's name be removed from the list. Based on my request his name was removed from the title award list.

It is important to note that Mr. Da Silva did not receive certificate in recognition of his participation in the seminar or a title award. It is also of note, that to my knowledge and I have not received any correspondence to the contrary, that Mr. Da Silva himself never appealed the decision, or that Mr. Da Silva claimed to have participated in the seminar (though there is no dispute that he did in fact pre-register for the event on line).

To the best of my knowledge, there were no other appeals on this issue.

In conclusion, I would like to emphasize that I do not know Mr. Da Silva personally, I had no intention of awarding him the title, nor did I have any intention of awarding a title to anyone who did not attend a seminar or had not passed the examination.

It has become clear upon my detailed examination of this matter that we can learn some lessons to improve our seminars in the future, such as:

- Native language lecturers should be on hand at the seminar to allow for clear and easy communication between the organizers and participants;
- Web based application that allows automated on-line registration (instead of e-mails), recordation of daily attendance, test scores, credentials and suggested title award.

Implementing these and other changes would eliminate the need for manual paperwork reconciliations, reducing the chance of errors and more transparency, except of course computer data input errors.

Sincerely,

Michael Khodarkovsky

TRG Councilor

**FTS-Brazil, 2011**

Sunday, November 27, 2011 9:52 AM

From: "Michael Khodarkovsky" <mkhodarkovsky@yahoo.com>
To: grivasefs@yahoo.co.uk
Cc: "TC Adrian Mikhailchishin" <gmadrian@hotmail.com>, "Gurevich Mikhail" <mgurev@hotmail.com>
1 File (126KB)



FTS-BRA ...

Dear Stratos,

Please find attached a document with recommended titles for those who participated at the FTS in Caldas Novas, Brazil during the 2011 WYCC.

Here are the notes that Misha G. and I made for the following candidates:

- We recommend Fikret Sideif Zade for the FST as we know him as a dedicated coach for many years who developed a numerous GMs and IMs in Azerbaijan;
- We recommend that GM Pavel Tregubov should provide a written confirmation that he was indeed a coach to Vladimir Kramnik. Meantime we recommend FT for him;
- Ryan Harper and Aucay Pelaez have FI titles already, however their trainers credentials are not sufficient yet for the upgrade to FT. I spoke to Allan Herbert and he suggested that they suppose to go over again their credentials and if they will be able to provide an update on the results of their work then TRG may upgrade their titles to FT. However, if the data is still insufficient then to hold the upgrade until they will be able to qualify for the FT, but count this seminar and examination towards the FT titles. Another words, he suggests, that they would not have to take another seminar whenever their credentials will fit the qualification criteria for the FT title;
- There were 6 more individuals who intended to attend a seminar - 5 from Argentina and 1 from Brazil. Argentinians completed forms, where present first half of the first day of the seminar, but then all left since didn't understand English.
Brazilian - Pereira, Leonardo attended 3 days, but didn't take an examination.
I have information on all 6 of them and if you feel we should include them on the list, please let me know and I will do this upon return home.

There were several obstacles to run this seminar, which Misha G., probably told you about. Nevertheless, we think it was ultimately a successful seminar.

I'm going to leave a hotel in about an hour and will be back home by Monday night.

Very best,
Michael

**TRG Seminar - Correction**

Friday, December 2, 2011 2:15 PM

From: "Michael Khodarkovsky" <mkhodarkovsky@yahoo.com>
To: "Efstratios Grivas" <grivasefs@hotmail.com>
Cc: "Gurevich Mikhail" <mgurev@hotmail.com>

Dear Stratos,

I checked the notes from the seminar upon arrival. According to our (M.G. and mine) handwritten notes - the FI title to Mr. Jefferson Rian was not awarded.

The technical error occurred in the submitted document due to late electronic filing of the trainers application made by Mr. Jefferson Rian directly to TRG and was erroneously inserted in the working spreadsheet.

Since the title of the aforementioned individual wasn't awarded please remove his name from the list of trainers who completed the course of the seminar in Caldas Novas.

Best regards,
Michael Khodarkovsky

The opinion of Mr.Gourevitch, about what happened in TRG seminar in Brasil.

From: Mikhail Gourevitch [mailto:mgurev@hotmail.com]
Sent: Tuesday, May 29, 2012 2:38 PM
To: Ali Nihat Yazici; Ali Nihat Yazici; Ali Nihat Yazici
Subject: TRG Seminar

Mr. President,

Following your demand in Ankara, I would like to make a reconstruction of events connected with so-called participation of Brazilian trainer Da Silva in the seminar in Brasil Caldas Novas during Juniors' WCH. ..

1.Name of Mr. Da Silva appeared initially in the list of participants on the very early stage of the seminar. As I understand , he was the first , or one of the first who made preinscription and sent his card to TRG.

2.The moment seminar started , Mr. Da Silva was never seen among participants. Although there was some language problems, as many Latin American participants, could not speak any English, this was the reason the whole Argentinian group of 5 trainer left the seminar soon after the registration. I have managed to save number of participants, who claimed they could understand some english, by giving them permission to make written examination, what had to follow after the seminar, in Spanish...

3. In the middle of the seminar, producing (printing) the whole documentation of the seminar and making preparation for the exam, with the help of TSF printer, I removed Mr. Da Silva from the list.

(I can see it now from Grivas email of the time, asking where this name disappeared) . It have to be said that we never saw the main organizer Darcy Lima during the whole event, as well as Mr. Da Silva, and only chance to prepare the documentation was the kindness of Yasin Emrah who gave permission to use TSF printer.

4. Last day of the seminar.Sitting at the pool together with Khodarkovsky immediately after the exam, and producing the final results of the seminar, we checked with utmost attention that no participant would be given any title who did not participate in the seminar. At the same time we were checking the results of exams. Every participant who did not come to examination was automatically denied the right for the titles, his name in the list crossed over. At this moment we signed the final results, and my participation in the seminar was finished. Following day Turkish delegation left Caldas Novas.

5. As the seminar was taking place in the hotel where Michel Khodarkovsky was staying, it was our agreement that the whole documentation (number of kilos) stays with him. He had to produce, and he did, the electronic form of the final results following our decisions, to send it later to Grivas.

6. I have never signed any document with Mr. Da Silva name in it, and I would never approve the title of participant who never even appeared in the seminar... So, you may imagine my surprise, a shock, an anger when I learned from the email of Grivas, response to Darcy Lima, following the seminar, that Mr. Da Silva was awarded some title by us. I have contacted Michel Khodarkovsky by Skype immediately on reception of this email from Grivas, asking explanations on the matter. Michel said it was some mistake in their communications with Grivas, promised to write an official response. After his official response, the TRG removed the title of Mr. Da Silva...

This is about it, I have huge number of emails following the seminar. In case of any importance I may forward to you all these emails.

Best regards.
Gurevich Mikhail
IGM, FST